Transforming European Citizenship – Policy Review

Yuri Borgmann-Prebil

European Commission

DG RTD - Open and Inclusive Societies

Transforming European Citizenship Rationale for Policy Review

- Object: Assess recent developments, trends, narratives and future prospects of EU Citizenship

- Actuality: EU Citizenship Report 2017, 60 years Treaty of Rome / *changing political landscape (populism, BREXIT, radicalisation & terrorism)*

- *Problem: EU Citizenship has insufficient resonance and relevance for significant groups*

- Double difficulty: **How to be meaningful for those least likely to take advantage of market/mobility benefits and how to engage those same disaffected groups politically**

- Role for citizenship in social justice?

Syntheses key findings of EU funded projects:

- **bEUCitizen**
- **LIVEWHAT, RESCuE (resilience)**
- **SOLIDUS, TransSOL (solidarity)**
- **EUCROSS (transnational life practices)**

- FRAME, CITIPSYCE, MYPLACE, PIDOP, EUENGAGE, ENLIGHTEN, TransCrisis, REMINDER

- ➤ Prepared by *Prof Malcolm Ross* (Sussex) and *Dr Irina Ciornei* (Bern)

Structure of the Review

1) Introduction
2) Discourses and **Trajectories of EU Citizenship**
3) Capturing the 'real' – making EU Citizenship more **resilient**
4) Beyond the market: a transformative **social citizenship**?
5) Transforming the politics of citizenship and **political citizenship**
6) Conclusion

'(Fundamental) Status' Narrative

- Revolves around **free movement, inclusivity, equal treatment**
- Treaty v Citizens' Rights Directive (tiered structure)
- High point: Court allowed **reliance on citizenship even where no movement** had been exercised
- More recently retrenchment closer to the pre-citizenship positions whereby:
  - ➢ **Work is *not simply a right* but an *obligation* for residence,** *unless self-sufficient*
- Non-binary but degrees of inclusivity/exclusivity
- Hierarchical ideas of deservingness and belonging
- End point: social good v reward (work, good citizen)?

Sociological turn: from Legal to Real I
Solidarity Practices

- Grass-roots coming together of particular groups in society (TransSOL, SOLIDUS)
- **Shared lived solidarity practices** and experience, rather than conferred legal status, make the difference
- Derive from voluntary activities – (crisis responses)
- **Nascent solidarity remains to be matched by a EU level articulation of social justice**
- Aspiration: *MS act 'according to' rather than (just) in the 'spirit of' solidarity*? (TransSOL)
- **Citizenship: way of capturing the respect for values such as dignity, equality and diversity**

Sociological turn: from Legal to Real II
Europeanisation of everyday life (EUCROSS)

- Transnational practices: 'debordering' of Europe
- Typology of 6 clusters: **locals** (>30%) to **transnationals** (6%) – *virtual transnationals, visitors, tourists and returnees* – between the extremes
- Stronger economic situation, being older, having a partner from another MS, frequent communication abroad, knowing foreign languages boast EU identity.
- Caveat: embedded in cosmopolitanism? (*DK & DE*)

- ➢ Nevertheless, there is **scope for citizenship to reach out beyond its current limitations to reflect real-life experiences**

Capturing the 'real' – making EU Citizenship more resilient

- Resilience , solidarity and citizenship are mutually linked and causally connected.

- Solidarity and resilience practices **need support to transform the experiential value of citizenship.**

- Only by **capturing these realities** can EU citizenship become a **more resilient and relevant** institution which **includes the vulnerable and disaffected**.

- **Interventions** cannot be left to local volunteers or to MS who may be inclined to welfare chauvinism.

Resilience approach to citizenship

- Concentrates upon evidence, context, cross-scale connections and the 'real' processes.
- EU citizenship: **institution that houses and mediates the relations of EU citizens among themselves and with EU**, national and local levels of governance.
- Applied to citizens themselves
- **Normative content** and force of citizenship cannot be independent of **actual citizenship practices**.
- Manifests a **strong social component**, e.g. shift from 2000 Lisbon Strategy to Europe 2020 strategy for the EU's **social investment model**
- Develops and **sustains itself through reflexive and contextualised processes**

Resilient Citizenship

- Flexibility & ability to transform – or 're-envision' (bEUcitizen) essential
- A **key finding**: some of the **historically fundamental tenets of EU citizenship are at risk**, undermined or rendered irrelevant by socio-political realities
- Approach/arrival of **tipping factors** (e.g. low levels of take-up of mobility, movers from the two ends of the social/income spectrum)
- Call for **reappraisal of EU citizenship**; what it can add to the fabric of European society?
- **EU citizenship = cypher for the existential sustainability of the EU** as a functioning, relevant and effective political and social actor.

10

Solidarity and Resilience Practices

- **Solidarity practices are resilience strategies**
- Provide complementary analyses of the real-life behaviours of citizens in times of crisis.
- Resilience **not achieved** through **top-down structures**
- *Cannot replace the welfare state* (RESCuE).
- Resilient practices (e.g. informal work, good networks) rely on *indirect* **support and infrastructure**
- *Direct* **interventions**, where the above practices fail
- **Investments** into the welfare state and public infrastructure are **important for sustaining the resilience opportunities** (RESCuE).

Differentiated Integration and Solidarity (White Paper scenario 3)

- Calls into question whether citizenship can become a **more relational concept**, i.e. comparison when **between EU citizens** rather than between migrant EU citizen and nationals the host State.

- The North-South divide: adds cleavage

- Puts emerging trends and manifestations of transnational solidarity to a test.

- Raises **serious questions about what a society of equals means in practice** in the supranational arrangement of the EU.

Beyond the market:
a transformative social citizenship?

- Focus on market & mobility exposes limitations of citizenship for the real lives of the vulnerable, disengaged or disaffected
- **Engaging with 'the social'** => opportunity for a more extensive and **meaningful citizenship**
- Contextual rather than doctrinal, realistic rather than legalistic
- Tap and **build upon the nascent solidarity** between citizens presently often unchannelled
- There is evidence of (varying) **support for redistributive/social justice policies to be adopted at EU level** – e.g. minimum income support, long-term care

Paradoxes of Social Citizenship

- EU citizenship increasingly exposed its limitations
- **empowerment and re-introduced link between economic and political citizenship**
- Empowerments **re-introduced new inequalities**
- **Trilemma**:
  - Welfare austerity
  - Individualisation of social risk
  - Welfare state chauvinism

- **Social rights**: 'the final stone in the arch which holds up the **roof of citizenship**' (Dahrendorf)
- **Opportunity to recast citizenship** v practical & legal hurdles, 'Precariat' of vulnerable, marginalised or excluded

Absolute net difference of weekly unemployment benefits between country of origin and country of destination, 2014

		COUNTRY OF ORIGIN																							
		Soc-Dem		Conservative						Liberal		Mediterranean					A8								A2	
		DK	SE	NL	BE	FI	FR	DE	AT	IE	UK	IT	ES	PT	MT	EL	SI	CZ	LV	EE	SK	HU	PL	LT	BG	RO
SD	DK		-93	-20	-26	-70	-123	-140	-153	-182	-277	-149	-155	-232	-274	-286	-227	-291	-292	-296	-301	-312	-323	-324	-328	-340
	SE	93		73	67	23	-30	-47	-60	-89	-184	-56	-62	-139	-181	-193	-135	-198	-199	-203	-208	-220	-230	-232	-236	-248
Conservative	NL	20	-73		-6	-50	-103	-120	-133	-162	-257	-129	-135	-212	-254	-266	-208	-271	-272	-276	-281	-293	-303	-305	-309	-321
	BE	26	-67	6		-44	-97	-114	-126	-156	-251	-123	-128	-206	-248	-260	-201	-265	-266	-270	-275	-286	-297	-298	-302	-314
	FI	70	-23	50	44		-53	-70	-83	-112	-207	-79	-85	-162	-204	-216	-157	-221	-222	-226	-231	-242	-253	-254	-258	-270
	FR	123	30	103	97	53		-17	-29	-59	-154	-26	-31	-109	-151	-163	-104	-168	-169	-173	-178	-189	-200	-201	-205	-217
	DE	140	47	120	114	70	17		-13	-42	-137	-9	-15	-92	-134	-146	-87	-151	-152	-156	-161	-173	-183	-184	-189	-201
	AT	153	60	133	126	83	29	13		-29	-124	4	-2	-79	-122	-133	-75	-138	-139	-143	-148	-160	-171	-172	-176	-188
Lib	IE	182	89	162	156	112	59	42	29		-95	33	27	-50	-92	-104	-46	-109	-110	-114	-119	-131	-141	-143	-147	-159
	UK	277	184	257	251	207	154	137	124	95		128	122	45	3	-9	50	-14	-15	-19	-24	-35	-46	-47	-52	-64
Mediterr.	IT	149	56	129	123	79	26	9	-4	-33	-128		-6	-83	-125	-137	-78	-142	-143	-147	-152	-164	-174	-175	-180	-192
	ES	155	62	135	128	85	31	15	2	-27	-122	6		-77	-120	-131	-73	-136	-137	-141	-146	-158	-169	-170	-174	-186
	PT	232	139	212	206	162	109	92	79	50	-45	83	77		-42	-54	5	-59	-60	-64	-69	-80	-91	-92	-96	-108
	MT	274	181	254	248	204	151	134	122	92	-3	125	120	42		-12	47	-17	-18	-22	-27	-38	-49	-50	-54	-66
	EL	286	193	266	260	216	163	146	133	104	9	137	131	54	12		59	-5	-6	-10	-15	-26	-37	-38	-42	-55
A8	SI	227	135	208	201	157	104	87	75	46	-50	78	73	-5	-47	-59		-64	-64	-69	-74	-85	-96	-97	-101	-113
	CZ	291	198	271	265	221	168	151	138	109	14	142	136	59	17	5	64		-1	-5	-10	-21	-32	-33	-37	-49
	LV	292	199	272	266	222	169	152	139	110	15	143	137	60	18	6	64	1		-4	-9	-21	-31	-33	-37	-49
	EE	296	203	276	270	226	173	156	143	114	19	147	141	64	22	10	69	5	4		-5	-16	-27	-28	-32	-44
	SK	301	208	281	275	231	178	161	148	119	24	152	146	69	27	15	74	10	9	5		-11	-22	-23	-27	-39
	HU	312	220	293	286	242	189	173	160	131	35	164	158	80	38	26	85	21	21	16	11		-11	-12	-16	-28
	PL	323	230	303	297	253	200	183	171	141	46	174	169	91	49	37	96	32	31	27	22	11		-1	-5	-17
	LT	324	232	305	298	254	201	184	172	143	47	175	170	92	50	38	97	33	33	28	23	12	1		-4	-16
A2	BG	328	236	309	302	258	205	189	176	147	52	180	174	96	54	42	101	37	37	32	27	16	5	4		-12
	RO	340	248	321	314	270	217	201	188	159	64	192	186	108	66	55	113	49	49	44	39	28	17	16	12	

COUNTRY OF DESTINATION (row axis)

Legend:
- higher in origin than in destination country
- up to 25% lower in the destination country
- 25-50% lower than in the destination country
- more than 50% lower than in destination country

Notes: Weekly exportable unemployment benefit calculated for mobile unemployed single EU citizens without children with 67% of AW for the initial period of unemployment; Cyprus excluded as data on net annual earnings is unavailable; Luxembourg excluded as outlier with disproportionately large proportion of EU migrant citizens

Source: Eurostat (http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/labour-market/earnings/database), OECD (http://www.oecd.org/els/benefits-and-wages-statistics.htm)

Defining European Social Citizenship

- **References to 'social' in primary EU law**, e.g. 'social market economy', combating 'social exclusion', 'social justice', 'social cohesion' 'social progress', 'the guarantee of social protection', Charter chapters equality & solidarity

- Evolution: **social policy** morphed from **securing market integration** to **delivering social policies**.

- Constraints without Treaty revision to the legal competences of the EU, **little political appetite for change**

- The trajectory towards a **centrality of social policies, and social justice**

European Pillar of Social Rights – European Social Union

Social Pillar

- Guide towards efficient employment and social outcomes
- Future of citizenship: market v social content
- Drive reforms & serve as a **compass for renewed convergence within the euro area**
- Modernise, broaden and deepen **social rights**

European Social Union

- **Union of national welfare states**
- Intertwined relationship of economic and social
- **Social progress necessary** (not just desirable): limits to diversity in social systems accommodated in a monetary union

Solidarity: Core of Social Citizenship

- Trade-offs between a pan-European solidarity and solidarity within national welfare states

- Example: health care (patient mobility v national insurance and welfare system)

- Public goods perspective: 'we'-feeling, redistributive justice, **particularistic sense of solidarity**

- **Key question: Does solidarity actually exist at European level (spatial dimension), forms, attitudes**

- **Empirical basis for solidarity is critical** for arguments in support of stronger social interventions and legitimacy

- Only if **Europeanised equality receives public backing** can European social union obtain a legitimate basis

Citizenship antinomies

- **Internal selectivity**
  - (political) equality v political participation
  - **Socio-economic status**, structural factors of contemporary European societies

  ➢ Exasperated at EU level

- **External selectivity**
  - Universal aspiration of equality v particular (national) communities; **confrontation with cosmopolitan promise,** *=> Borders*!
  - **EU Citizenship challenges external selectivity** of *national* citizenship

Democratic deficit, institutional architecture of the EU, power imbalances

Institutional, electoral considerations

- Old & young citizens less likely to participate in EU elections (no gender difference though)
  - ➢ Target these with information campaigns

  Economic inequalities unfold in political inequalities which aggravate the lack of representation at the European level of the interests of those citizens who are socio-economically deprived.

- Some indication of a 'new parliamentarism', enhanced dialogue between MS and EU
  - ➢ Balancing the political authority of the Council and the European Parliament,
  - ➢ Introducing transnational party lists

21

Categorising political participation

Latent political participation		Manifest political participation		
Involvement (attention)	**Civic engagement (action)**	**Formal or conventional political participation**	**Activism (non-electoral participation)**	
			Legal	Illegal
I n d i v i d u a l f o r m s				
Personal interest in politics and societal issues Attentiveness to political issues	Activities based on personal interest in and attention to politics and societal issues	Electoral participation and contact activities	Extra-parliamentary forms of participation: to make once voice heard or to make a difference by individual means (e.g. signing petitions, political consumption)	Politically motivated unlawful acts on an individual basis
C o l l e c t i v e f o r m s				
Sense of belonging to a group or a collective with distinct political profile or agenda Life-style related politics (e.g. identity, clothes, music, food, values)	Voluntary work to improve conditions in local community, for charity, or help others (outside own family and friends)	Organised political participation: membership in conventional political parties, trade unions and organisations	Loosely organised forms or network-based political participation: New social movements, demonstrations, strikes, and protests	Illegal and violent activities and protests: Demonstrations, riots, squatting buildings, damaging property, confrontations with police or political opponents

22

Political Participation of the *Young*

- Complement/replace, *traditional forms of political engagement* with by **non-electoral action repertoires**
- **Driven by personal resources: education & income**
- Latent participation leads to political socialisation which can be capitalised upon in information campaigns
  - ➤ *But regard voting most effective form of participation*
  - ➤ *Believe in the significance of traditional media*

- Similarities/differences across Europe shaped by differing national contexts & traditions
- North/Eastern divide: Less active in Eastern Europe
- Southern Europe, economic crisis context, more confrontational form of participation

Attitudes towards the EU: *Transnational cleavage*

- Economic & political **inequalities increase polarisation of support for EU**, exacerbated by crises
  - ➢ Trust in EU is highly dependent on its capacity to provide equitable living conditions and welfare

- (Perceived) *lack of voice* and **value of education** & training (CITISPYCE)   =>   *Vicious circle*

  - ➢ Reinforces alienation, internal selectivity (1st antinomy)
  - ➢ '*permissive consensus*' to '*constraining dissensus*'
    - ➢ European Solidarity Corps

Some conclusions

- **Social citizenship** has the capacity to make a very significant contribution to the enhanced democratisation of the EU by engaging the groups who hitherto have either been excluded from EU citizenship or felt it to be irrelevant.

- Many of the same groups are the very people who do not participate politically in the EU sphere.

- A **'twin-track' approach of meaningful social policies** on the one hand and a **framework to encourage political participation** on the other could provide the key contribution of EU citizenship to a sustainable EU.